Short Story Sequences and the Narrative Strategy of Minority Literature:
Kenji Nakagami and Sandra Cisneros

Takako Tanaka

In Modern American Short Story Sequences: Composite Fictions and Fictive Communities, J. Gerald Kennedy values "multiplicity" (xi), and suggests that a short story sequence suits contemporary minority writers who prefer diversity in describing their community. If the minority writers criticize the coercion of mainstream culture to the minorities, they should not make a similar mistake by enforcing a communal or aesthetic order of their own. Nevertheless, the sense of community, though sometimes uncertain, still holds as an important issue in their texts.

In the case of Sandra Cisneros, a Chicana writer, the sense of community is one of the themes she pursues in The House on Mango Street (1984). The House on Mango Street is a collection of vignettes in which the author depicts the moral development of a Mexican-American girl in Chicago through multiple phases. Esperanza, the heroine, often feels isolated in her own community, but she recognizes the Mango Street neighborhood as the place she belongs to.
even though she might leave it someday in near future.

In Cisneros's next collection of short stories, *Woman Hollering Creek and Other Stories* (1991), however, each story has a different heroine (or a hero in a few cases), and the setting differs in each story, from Chicago to Texas, or even to Mexico. Here, Mexican-Americans on the unstable border of multicultural situations are usually at a loss and isolated. Neither family nor community, nor solidarity among women is strong enough to give full support to the heroines.

If *The House on Mango Street* asserts the barrio as the center of Esperanza's identity, *Woman Hollering Creek* refuses its heroines the strong sense of belonging to any place. Further, while Cisneros in *The House on Mango Street* criticizes Mexican patriarchy indirectly through a girl's innocent eyes, the author of *Woman Hollering Creek* is determined to destroy the stereotypical images of well-known women in Mexican beliefs and legends. The deconstruction of traditional women symbols such as the Virgin of Guadalupe, Llorona, or Malinche, is in agreement with Chicana writers' activism, which fights against the dominance of patriarchal Mexican culture.¹

Cisneros's target of criticism in *Woman Hollering Creek*, however, is not only against Mexican patriarchy but also against American commercialism. Admittedly, many Chicano writers have depicted Mexican-American families' struggle for survival in the U.S. in their novels. In accordance with the Chicano movement, they often incorporate Aztec myths in their texts to empower the heroes in dire social circumstances. Rudolfo A. Anaya's *Heart of Aztlan* is a good example.² A family fights as a unit against the American exploitation of Mexican-Americans, and though women also grow strong in their own ways, the father leads the way in their social protest. But Cisneros's choice of a short story sequence rather than a novel suggests a style of resistance different from that of Chicano writers. *Woman Hollering Creek* gives voice to many people and shows myriad fragments of minority lives. Though it lacks the vantage point of a main plot or a commanding unity of resistance against main culture, her stories assert multiplicity of border experiences among Mexican-Americans, at the same time as they indicate the frightful infiltration of American pop culture into the immigrants' life.

This essay examines Cisneros's resistance to Mexican patriarchal culture as well as to American commercialism and imperialism in her short story sequence. We compare her way of resistance in narration with that of Kenji Nakagami of Japan. Kenji Nakagami was recognized as one of the great literary masters in Japan after World War II, following
Kenzaburo Oe, a Nobel-Prize novelist. He wrote many novels and short stories, but unfortunately, Nakagami died of kidney cancer in 1992 at the age of 46. In all probability, Nakagami did not know about Cisneros in his lifetime. The reasons I choose Nakagami here to compare with Cisneros are as follows:

First, Nakagami comes from an outcaste class in old Japan called Burakumin, Japanese pariahs or untouchables. The Burakumin class is not an ethnic but a social class. The scholars do not agree over when or why the discrimination started in Japanese society, but the discrimination against Burakumin was formally established in the Edo Period. The Meiji government banned discrimination against the Burakumin in 1871, but the discrimination continued even after World War II. Today, the discrimination does not exist in Japan, at least on the surface, but Nakagami regards himself as minority, and it was in 1977 that he revealed his origin in public.

Secondly, Nakagami has a strong sense of community. He wrote many short stories and novels about fictional "Roji," a ghetto community in a rural, old castle town of Shingu, located in the south-east of a large peninsula in the middle part of Japan. Roji, literally meaning "alley," is a community where Burakumin people, though discriminated by the outside world, hold strong kinship and comradeship. After Nakagami traveled to the U.S.A., Korea and other parts of the world, he announced that "Roji" existed all over the world in different ghettos, and recognized the possibility of solidarity with other minorities. As a matter of fact, Nakagami became interested in Chicano laborers while he was in the U.S. in 1979, and acquired some novels by Chicano writers.

Third, Nakagami was versed in Japanese myths and legends. Nakagami's Roji reflects his own neighborhood in Shingu City, in the Kumano area. Kumano is a mountainous region facing the sea except for the north, and is a legendary space related to the origin of ancient Japan. In the Middle Ages, three famous Kumano shrines in the mountains attracted pilgrims from far away, including Emperors, aristocrats, and plebeians. The shrines represent the juncture of Buddhism and Shintoism (coming from the animistic religion of ancient Japan) in the history of Japanese religion. Pilgrims' expectations were quite high for the purification of their sins, healing of their diseases, and a promise of paradise after death. But the road to Kumano was long and full of hardships, and the weak, sick pilgrims could die on the way in the mountains. Kumano was the land not only for the living, but of the dead, of mystery and salvation.

Nakagami wrote many short stories based on the folklore of Kumano, as well as on the actual ghetto community. The salvation of a destitute orphan, or the healing of a leprosy-
stricken pilgrim, is a typical Japanese miracle of the damned metamorphosing into a purified, sacred being so often narrated in Kumano legends. Nakagami, aware of his origin as Burakumin outcaste, was strongly attracted to such salvation myths. Because he was born illegitimate, Nakagami was especially fascinated with the Japanese legend of a noble prince wanderer, who was finally recognized after a long journey of hardship by his father, a man of high or of highest rank in court. The theory of a noble prince wanderer as an archetypal hero in Japanese narratives was presented by Orikuchi Shinobu, a famous folklorist, literary scholar and poet of Japan. Nakagami was quite impressed with Orikuchi's theory, and appreciated the archetypal prince as the original hero of Japanese narratives. But Nakagami was fully aware, at the same time, of the alluring trap in such legends. As a Burakumin minority, he suspected such a legendary salvation by a "Father" or Emperor was fatal. The salvation legends serve to preserve the residue of hierarchy and discrimination. Therefore, while Nakagami's tales about Kumano remind the reader of famous legends and of classical literary texts based on this region, Nakagami makes his tales subtly different, or makes them serve as parodies. He stands on an equal footing with Cisneros for his resistance to myths and legends that tacitly fix discrimination and spellbind the minority.

Thus, Nakagami's minority position, a strong sense of place and community, his appreciation for and resistance to classical Japanese legends and myths, all affect his narration, just as Cisneros's situations affect hers. Besides, in the middle of his career, Nakagami deliberately wipes out Roji, and severs his characters' tie with it. His decision comes with the actual disappearance of his old neighborhood caused by the commercial development of the area. As a result, Nakagami's heroes become nomads and stray all over Japan or even go abroad. The people of Roji must fight not only with subtle discrimination but also with the late capitalism of Japanese society which devours and sanitizes the old ghetto by modernization and commercialization. Sandra Cisneros also shares the problems of these predicaments for minority people in her writing.

To the readers' dismay, however, Nakagami's nomadic heroes in his later novels are rather flat, mechanical characters repeating monotonous actions. Critics wonder if this is Nakagami's deliberate and desperate effort to go beyond the foreclosing charm of the intimate space and the traditional Japanese narratives. Nakagami's nomadic heroes come from Roji, but the author refuses to apply the rich resources of his literary imagination associated with Roji. It takes time to examine and evaluate Nakagami's heroes scattered all over Japan, but Nakagami's short story sequences on Roji and Kumano apparently depict more dramatic
tension among the ghetto community, the people alienated even from that community, and Japanese society.

In this essay we will discuss the problem of narration Nakagami and Cisneros share in describing their minority community and its loss, and will further see how the Chicana writer's desire for communal memory as well as for the deconstruction of legends creates different short story sequences from those of Nakagami, who struggles against the fascination and the burden of Japanese historical memory and narratives. We will mainly examine Cisneros's *Woman Hollering Creek* and Nakagami's *Kumano Shuh* [*Kumano Collections*] (1984).

Cisneros's *Woman Hollering Creek* deals with people who have some sort of Mexican background, but each of the characters lives his/her own life independently, and they do not share their local community experiences. Still, the stories in *Woman Hollering Creek* vaguely assume a sort of chronological order because they are divided into three parts and the heroines get older from Part 1 to Part 3. Among them, part 2 holds only two stories about teen-aged girls, but these two, "One Holy Night" and "My Tocaya," give a funny but subversive message.

"My Tocaya" parodies Jesus Christ's death and resurrection through a Mexican-American girl, who was thought murdered but found alive three days later. Her parents carelessly misidentify a body as their daughter's, and the Catholic school she attends expresses solemn condolence, but Patricia appears three days later, saying she just ran away from home. The story is narrated by her schoolmate, who displays envy and disgust at the huge media attention her namesake receives over the incident. The contrast with the biblical holiness creates bitter irony at the same time as it reveals the unsafe and dreary environment many Mexican-American teenagers are put in. The Catholic institution cannot save the Mexican-American youth from the wasteland of American civilization.

"One Holy Night," the other story in Part II, also ridicules religious holiness. Ixchel's boyfriend of a very short period is arrested as a serial killer. He was not as young as he said, and he was not "of an ancient line of Mayan kings." Ixchel's first sexual experience with the man was full of wonder for her, but in a big city it is one of the banal things that go on at night. She escapes becoming the man's next victim (that is, if he is really the serial killer as the police says), presumably because she believed all he said. But the man becomes more pathetic if he sustains his pride in American society only by his identification with the imaginary Mayan royal ancestors. The story is not only a parody of Christianity but also of Mexican masculinity supported by Mexican myth. Cisneros, however, seems uncertain about how to evaluate the heroine. Ixchel is sent back to Mexico for getting pregnant. She
still loves the man, but says that she hopes to have four more children without mentioning who their father will be. The girl is not a Virgin Mary, but is she a Mexican earth goddess, who praises maternity and the dynamic power of the land that survives the cruel American capitalistic society? Or is she just an ignorant girl?

Cisneros destroys Catholic authority and revitalizes Mexican Goddesses, but refrains from depending too much on the empowering icons or native soil. Her female characters are not superhuman. Even the heroine of “Eyes of Zapata,” gifted with supernatural power of the indigenous animism and faithful to her lover, famous Emiliano Zapata during the Mexican Revolution, sadly recognizes his patriarchal egoism. Some other characters are trapped by American popular culture. The girls in “Barbie-Q” love Barbie dolls, and Clemencia in “Never Marry a Mexican” cannot win her lover away from his wife, who she calls as “Barbie doll” (79). But these heroines fight a desperate fight against the American power on their own. The girls get Barbie dolls damaged by fire in a warehouse: the slightly burned dolls will do and the author sees the comic side of it in the title “Barbie-Q,” the barbequed Barbie dolls. The heroine of “Bien Pretty” finds consolation of her lost love in watching birds gather towards the evening, and especially enjoys the pronouncing sound of a Spanish word “urracas [grackles].” The pure, rhythmical sound and the flight of birds fascinate her and make her forget her grief for a while. Her delicate sympathy with sound and motion is in good contrast with the wordy, stereotyped complaint of unhappy love narrated by a man in the vignette “Tin Tan Tan” before this story.

In “Woman Hollering Creek,” Cisneros upsets the image of Llorona, asserts the solidarity of women against domestic violence, and suggests that a Mexican-American woman can holler like Tarzan. But with her call for action in agreement with Chicana writers, she also describes each individual’s different sense of displacement, and attempts subtle deconstruction and liberation of the reader’s perception of minority people through language and arrangement of her narratives.

In Nakagami’s Kumano Collections, on the other hand, the stories share the Kumano area for the background, as the title indicates. But the collection is an unusual combination of fantastic short stories which are not related to each other, and the essays in which the author casually writes about what happens to his daily life. The collection was written about the time Nakagami started writing the last of his famous Akiyuki trilogy. The trilogy is about a family struggle surrounding Akiyuki, a young man from Roji. At the end of the third novel
of the trilogy, *Chi no Hate, Shijo no Toki* [The Ends of the Earth, the Supreme Time] (begun around 1981 and published in 1983), Nakagami makes his Roji disappear due to the development of a new supermarket. Akiyuki, the hero of the trilogy, also disappears and never presents himself in Nakagami's texts again. Nakagami actually witnessed the disappearance of his old neighborhood in January 1980 when he came back from his four-month sojourn in the U.S.A. In some of the autobiographical essays in the *Kumano Collection*, Nakagami refers to the ongoing battles for economic gains among the land developers and neighbors in Shingu City, including his own relatives. Some of these essays were published monthly in 1980 on a literary magazine, before put into the *Kumano Collection* and published in 1984. According to Nakagami's ironical comment, the land developers of Shingu City at the time rushed out to buy the literary magazine in order to find out any information about the actions of Nakagami's relatives, who were their rival developers.10

In Japanese literature, the "I" novel, in which the first-person narrator author tells what happened to his/her life, adhering faithfully to the facts, has been a common style of novel since Japan started modernization and Westernization in 1868. The "I" novel combines a confessional and realistic style, and is supposed to be modern in contrast with the traditional Japanese tales of old. What is remarkable about Nakagami's literary style in general is that he can write both ways: the "realistic" "I" novel-like style and the evocative style of old fantastic tales. In his novels Nakagami usually keeps the blatant realism, but it is often combined with gothic, baroque imagery and strenuous, complicated sentences. In the *Kumano Collection*, the reportage-like essays read like a hasty first draft for an "I" novel. He talks about his family troubles in a matter-of-fact way, as well as about the destruction of Roji. In these essays which count 8 out of 14 texts in the collection, however, the author also talks about his position as a minority writer and what Roji means to him, and further describes some narrative plots or pursues imagery he finds fascinating. These parts of the essays read like a rough sketch for his new fantastic tales.

Six stories in the *Kumano Collection*, on the other hand, are pure fiction, and most of them remind Japanese readers of the classical tales of the 12th or 13th Centuries as well as of the fantastic short stories of the early 20th Century written by some Japanese novelists famous for their particular "Japanese" aesthetics. "Fushi [The Immortal]" and "Tsuki to Fushi [The Moon and the Immortal]" deal with a secular monk's encounter with a mysterious woman and the world of aliens in the Kumano mountains. The rough plot reminds one of similar legends in Japanese mountain areas, as well as of "Kohya-hijiri [The Holy Man of Mt. Kohya]"(1900), a
story by Izumi Kyoka (1873-1939) based on such legends. Izumi Kyoka is a Japanese novelist, famous for his Romanticism and archaic, aesthetic style. "Oni no Hanashi [The Tale of an Ogre]" and "Chuhtoh no Sakura [Robbers' Cherryblossoms]" are set in Kyoto in the Middle Ages: the former story narrates about a beautiful woman, who turns out to be a fierce ogre who kills the man she has seduced. The latter story depicts a merchant who becomes fascinated by a cruel woman robber and joins her group of robbers. Nakagami says in the beginning of the story that he was inspired by a contemporary robbery case which reminded him of some old Japanese tales from the 12th to the 13th Century. "Fukikomori [Housebound]" is the only story in the Kumano Collection about present-day Kumano, but the fantastic element increases when a day laborer starts living with a woman in a mountain village.11

Why does Nakagami put such a mixture of texts together into a collection? He was a prolific writer and published many essays as well as short stories, but the Kumano Collection is the only collection which includes such a variety of genres together. Many Japanese critics agree that the Kumano Collection is a monumental work which reveals Nakagami's will to deconstruct Japanese narratives. Karatani Kojin says that the Kumano Collection occupies an important turning point in Nakagami’s career, pointing to the concurrence of the creation of the Kumano Collection and The Ends of the Earth, the Supreme Time, the last novel of the Akiyuki Trilogy.12 Yamota Inuhiko states in Kishu to Tensei that the disappearance of Roji both in The Ends of the Earth, the Supreme Time and in actuality signals his determination to leave the classical Japanese construct of narratives in which the salvation myths abound.13 Watanabe Naomi says that Roji is a maternal space which reproduces such a construct of narratives and assures the dramatic and soothing recycle of the damned into the sacred.14 These critics suggest the move of Nakagami’s concerns around 1981 from kinship and Roji community to nomadic displacement and larger Japanese society,15 but before we discuss the significance of the Kumano Collection, it is better to see how Roji can be called a maternal space.

It sounds unreasonable that Roji, which has suffered most from the hierarchal discrimination, entertains the salvation myth of a prince wanderer: such a narrative ultimately depends on the paternal authority of the Emperor, which stands at the polar opposite of Burakumin. But Roji community has offered a womb-like space of protection for those despised by the outside world. Akiyuki in the trilogy realizes that he was raised by Roji, since his biological father left him and his mother while he was a little boy. Roji easily synchronizes with the mystic Kumano as haven and a spot for miracles. Indeed, Roji is a maternal space, in the sense that the community compensates for the social inequality with archetypal
and mythical salvation narratives. And at its best, Nakamami’s Roji produces narrative masterpieces. Both Yomota and Watanabe praise Sen’nen no Yuraku [Millennium of Joy] (1982), a collection of short stories written and published about the time the Kumano Collection was being written, as the greatest tribute Nakagami presents to the narrative power of Roji.16 Oryu-no-oba, an old midwife and narrator of the tales of Roji in Millennium of Joy, accepts all the obscene, the filthy and the sexual as well as violence, agony and early death of the men of Roji. She accepts whatever is, so comprehensively, that her euphoric narratives go beyond time as if the episodes of life and death she narrates represent Buddhist’s mandala. In spite of poverty, discrimination and violence, these “handsome” men of Roji enjoy their short happy life like a flare of firework, and Oryu-no-oba approves of them wholly as they are. Nakagami does not recognize himself as feminist, but Oryu-no-oba’s narration celebrates the jouissance of life and of narration at the same time she mourns these men’s early death. Her narration about the beauty and violence of the young heroes serves as secular mourning rituals.

While both Yomota and Watanabe praise the dynamic life energy of Millennium of Joy, however, they suggest that Nakagami could not have been satisfied with the mandala-like solution for the Burakumin problems such as poverty, displacement, and the continuing subtle discrimination. The last novel of the Akiyuki trilogy, The Ends of the Earth, the Supreme Time, criticizes not only Japanese capitalistic society but his ghetto community which is after the exploiting society so blindly. The Roji narratives may lead the author sometimes to a euphoric verbal mandala, but the comprehensive narration of Oryu-no-oba is closed up in itself.

The Kumano Collection certainly shows Nakagami’s inner conflict about the loss of Roji: Nakagami is determined to leave Roji, but he has not yet found the direction for his future writing. It is also possible to interpret that the mysterious and seductive women in the stories represent the traditional narrative style Nakagami must reject, though this type of woman appears often in Nakagami’s texts. But Nakagami’s Kumano Collection suggests more positively that these texts, like the Kumano area itself, offer a place not only for the living but for the dead and the aliens. Like the legendary Kumano, the collection of short stories and essays presents a cosmos where fantasy and reality meet, where the line between good and evil blurs, where the hero comes across a mysterious world of aliens at the same time as the author-narrator actually witnesses the total disappearance of his old neighborhood. The creatures such as monkeys, ravens or snakes silently invade the human habitation, and the murderer and his victim suffer alike. In “The Immortal,” the woman in the village asks the secular monk to save her while the monk asks the same of her even while he strangles her.
But salvation is an illusion, and the hero keeps on roaming, driven out both from society and the ghastly world of aliens alike. Unlike the religious Kumano, salvation is not granted.

In a couple of essays in the Kumano Collection, Nakagami refers to Japanese Noh plays and regards Zeami, a famous Noh actor and playwright in the Middle Ages, as a great artist. However, Nakagami also defies Zeami's ideal of art and says that he wants to reveal, unlike Zeami, everything, violence, the abominable, the terrible. In a metaphorical sense, the Kumano Collection tries to provide a space for presenting Noh plays: from Kagaminoma, a room where Noh players prepare and wait for their entrance, through the bridgeway (a passage) to the main stage. When Nakagami starts writing about his daily life, he is already in the Kagaminoma, and while the author adds fantastic imagery and suggests a rough plot of a story in his essays, he is crossing the bridgeway which is supposed to transfer the Noh-actor from the secular life to the main stage of the spiritual. The actual struggles over greed and family feud are apotheosized into the drama of the spirits on the main stage, but as the audience can see a part of the Noh-player’s face out of the mask on the stage, the Kumano Collection is the drama of flesh as well.

For Nakagami, the Kumano Collection is a short story sequence which represents his creative cosmos. It reflects his old neighborhood, and the history as well as the geography of the Kumano area, but it is also a verbal construct reminding one of the Noh stage, while it is evocative of popular tales of the Middle Ages as well. Nakagami indicates that only the visionary, a chosen artist like Zeami, can represent the real and the ethereal together. But he is also fond of the Japanese tales of the Middle Ages narrated by anonymous authors. Besides, there are also self-conscious similarities in Nakagami’s tales to the aesthetic texts of the famous writers generations back. These verbal concerns suggest that Nakagami does not simply turn his artistic interest towards realism and social problems at the disappearance of his Roji.

In Nakagami’s short story sequence coexist the real and the visionary, and the binary opposites also blur, but the highly artistic border zone of the displaced taxes the author with nightmarish chaos. On the other hand, the Woman Hollering Creek and Other Stories reads like an amalgam of poems. Cisneros’s Chicana feminist voice is certainly heard, but as a whole, she presents the diversity of Mexican-American life in a maze of imagery and crush of sound and motion like that of birds. Her expression of border experiences sounds more sprightly than Nakagami’s, but even in “Little Miracles, Kept Promises,” in which the author accepts the Mexican-American people’s prayers to the Virgin of Guadalupe as genuine and precious
expression of the people’s hope in life, the story is not a simple collection of actual prayers but her verbal construct negotiated and arranged. Both Nakagami and Cisneros are artists in the borderland of language as well as they are aware of their minority origins.

Notes

1 See Anzaldúa’s *Borderlands/La Frontera: The New Mestiza*, and *This Bridge Called My Back: Writings by Radical Women of Color*, which she edited with Cherrie Moraga. Sonia Saldivar-Hull discusses Cisneros’s Border Narratives and Chicana feminism in *Feminism on the Border: Chicana Gender Politics and Literature*, 81-123.


3 Their discrimination is said to have originated, according to some historians, in the 14th or 15th Century in Japan, but others suggest as early as the 9th Century. See George De Vos and Hiroshi Wagatsuma, *Japan’s Invisible Race: Caste in Culture and Personality* (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1966).


5 When the first Emperor of Japan entered Kumano with his army, the legend goes, a holy raven appeared and led him through mountains to his future capitol.


9 Cisneros says about this story that she still feels “like it’s not done” (Hector A. Torres, *Conversations with Contemporary Chicana and Chicano Writers* [Albuquerque: U of New Mexico P, 2007]), 230.

10 “Karasu [Raven],” *Kumano Collection* 345-46. See also, “Kajin [Sea God],” *KC* 95, 107, and “Yohreboshi [Evil Spirit Star].” *KC* 141.

11 There is also a short fiction “Katsu’ura.” The story tells about a kimono merchant and his daughter in the latter part of 19th Century going on a pilgrimage to Kumano area because they find some symptoms of leprosy on their bodies.


16 But Yomota also thinks that Nakagami is aware of the approaching demise of such narratives in *Millennium of Joy*. See *Kishu to Tensei*, 103.

17 Nakagami shows his sympathy with Zeami in “Chohtori [Butterfly Bird],” KC 63. His defiance to Zeami is expressed in “Shakkyoh,” KC 121.

Works Cited


---. *Kumano-Shuh [Kumano Collection]*. Tokyo: Kodansha Bunrei-Bunko, 2004


